

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WISCONSIN**

CODY FLACK, *et al.*,  
*individually and on behalf of all others  
similarly situated,*

Plaintiffs,

v.

WISCONSIN DEPARTMENT OF  
HEALTH SERVICES, *et al.*,

Defendants.

Case No. 3:18-cv-00309-wmc  
Judge William Conley

**REPLY BRIEF IN FURTHER SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO STRIKE  
EXPERT DECLARATION AND EXCLUDE TESTIMONY  
OF MICHELLE OSTRANDER, Ph.D.**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES ..... iii

INTRODUCTION..... 1

ARGUMENT.....3

I. **BECAUSE DR. OSTRANDER DID NOT FORM HER OWN OPINIONS OR STATE ANY OPINIONS IN HER DECLARATION, SHE HAS FAILED TO COMPLY WITH RULE 26, RULE 702, AND DAUBERT.**.....3

II. **DR. OSTRANDER’S PURPORTED OPINION ON THE OVERALL QUALITY OF THE RESEARCH EVIDENCE ON SURGICAL TREATMENTS FOR GENDER DYSPHORIA IS IRRELEVANT TO ANY FACTUAL DISPUTE.** .....9

A. **Defendants Are Improperly Attempting to Use Dr. Ostrander’s Testimony and the Hayes Reports Attached to Her Declaration to Generate “Disputes” on Topics for Which She Is Not Offering an Opinion.**..... 11

1. Overall Quality of the Evidence ..... 14

2. Efficacy in Treating Gender Dysphoria..... 15

3. Safety ..... 16

4. Medical Necessity..... 16

III. **EVEN IF DR. OSTRANDER’S PURPORTED OPINIONS WERE MATERIAL, PLAINTIFFS HAVE IDENTIFIED SIGNIFICANT RELIABILITY ISSUES WARRANTING EXCLUSION OF THOSE OPINIONS.**..... 17

A. **Federal Courts Have Uniformly Found Hayes Reports, on Their Own, to be an Insufficient Basis for Categorically Excluding Coverage for Medical Procedures.** ..... 18

B. **There Is No Indication That the Proprietary Hayes Letter-Grade Rating is Generally Accepted in the Field or Otherwise Replicable.** ..... 19

C. **Hayes’ Subjective Decisions About What Outcomes to Measure and What Studies to Review Raise Questions About the Overall Reliability of Their Conclusions.**..... 20

D. **The 2018 Annual Review on Ancillary Services Followed No Scientific Methodology.**..... 22

CONCLUSION ..... 23

**TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

<b>Cases</b>	<b>Page(s)</b>
<i>American Key Corp. v. Cole National Corp.</i> , 762 F.2d 1569 (11th Cir. 1985).....	7
<i>Boyer v. Weyerhaeuser Co.</i> , No. 14-cv-286-wmc, 2016 WL 705233 (W.D. Wis. Feb. 19, 2016).....	11
<i>Brown v. Burlington N. Santa Fe Ry. Co.</i> , 765 F.3d 765 (7th Cir. 2014).....	21
<i>Cates v. Whirlpool Corp.</i> , No. 15-cv-5980, 2017 WL 1862640 (N.D. Ill. May 9, 2017) .....	11
<i>Corporate Finance, Inc. v. Principal Life Insurance Co.</i> , No. 05-20595-CIV, 2006 WL 3365600 (S.D. Fla. Nov. 20, 2006).....	7
<i>Dura Auto. Sys. of Ind. v. CTS Corp.</i> , 285 F.3d 609 (7th Cir. 2002).....	5–6
<i>Ervin v. Johnson &amp; Johnson, Inc.</i> , 492 F.3d 901 (7th Cir. 2007).....	11
<i>Gopalratnam v. Hewlett-Packard Co.</i> , 877 F.3d 771 (7th Cir. 2017).....	5–6
<i>Ingram v. Novartis Pharm. Corp.</i> , 282 F.R.D. 563 (W.D. Okla. 2012) .....	8
<i>Kumho Tire Co. v. Carmichael</i> , 526 U.S. 137 (1999) .....	21
<i>Pecher v. Owens-Illinois, Inc.</i> , 859 F.3d 396 (7th Cir. 2017).....	11
<i>Rivera v. Heck</i> , No. 16-cv-673-wmc, 2018 WL 4354949 (W.D. Wis. Sept. 12, 2018) .....	11
<i>Tokio Marine &amp; Fire Ins. Co. v. Norfolk &amp; Western Ry. Co.</i> , 172 F.3d 44, 1999 WL 12931 (4th Cir. 1999) .....	5
<b>Rules</b>	<b>Page(s)</b>
Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(2)(B)(i).....	4
Fed. R. Evid. 702 .....	9, 11, 22

**REDACTED**

The text of this brief (pages 1 to 23), which refers throughout to information marked confidential by Defendants, is redacted pursuant to the Protective Order in this case.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Dated: July 3, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Joseph J. Wardenski

Joseph J. Wardenski

Jennifer I. Klar

Alexa T. Milton

Orly T. May

RELMAN, DANE & COLFAX PLLC

1223 19th Street, NW, Suite 600

Washington, DC 20036

Telephone: (202) 728-1888

Facsimile: (202) 728-0848

jwardenski@relmanlaw.com

jklar@relmanlaw.com

amilton@relmanlaw.com

omay@relmanlaw.com

Robert Theine Pledl

DAVIS & PLEDL, S.C.

1433 N. Water Street, Suite 400

Milwaukee, WI 53202

(414) 488-1354

rockpled@gmail.com

Abigail Coursolle

Catherine McKee

NATIONAL HEALTH LAW PROGRAM

200 N. Greensboro Street, Suite D-13

Carrboro, NC 27510

Telephone: (919) 968-6308

Facsimile: (919) 968-8855

coursolle@healthlaw.org

mckee@healthlaw.org

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*