

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

STATE OF NEW YORK, STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS, STATE OF COLORADO, STATE OF CONNECTICUT, STATE OF DELAWARE, DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA, STATE OF HAWAII, STATE OF ILLINOIS, STATE OF MAINE, STATE OF MARYLAND, STATE OF MICHIGAN, STATE OF MINNESOTA, STATE OF NEVADA, STATE OF NEW JERSEY, STATE OF NEW MEXICO, STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA, STATE OF OREGON, COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA, STATE OF RHODE ISLAND, STATE OF VERMONT, COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA, and STATE OF WISCONSIN,

Plaintiffs,

v.

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES, ALEX M. AZAR II, *in his official capacity as Secretary of Health and Human Services*, and ROGER SEVERINO, *in his official capacity as Director of the Office for Civil Rights at the United States Department of Health and Human Services*,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 1:20-cv-5583-AKH

**PLAINTIFFS' NOTICE OF RENEWED MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT ON  
ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURE ACT CLAIMS**

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 56, Plaintiffs renew their motion for partial summary judgment on the Administrative Procedure Act claims contained in their Complaint in this action.<sup>1</sup> *See* Compl. ¶¶ 257-279 [ECF No. 1].

Plaintiffs request that the Court declare that Nondiscrimination in Health and Health Education Programs or Activities, Delegation of Authority, 85 Fed. Reg. 37,160 (June 19, 2020) (“2020 Rule”) is arbitrary, capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accordance with law within the meaning of 5 U.S.C. § 706(2)(A); declare that the 2020 Rule is in excess of the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services’ statutory jurisdiction, authority, or limitations, or short of statutory right within the meaning of 5 U.S.C. § 706(2)(C); vacate and set aside the 2020 Rule in its entirety; and enjoin Defendants and all their officers, employees, and agents, and anyone acting in concert with them, from implementing, applying, or taking any action whatsoever under the 2020 Rule.

In support of this motion, Plaintiffs rely on the concurrently filed Memorandum of Law, Local Rule 56.1 Statement of Undisputed Material Facts, the Declaration of Joseph Wardenski dated December 2, 2020, and the exhibits attached thereto; the Administrative Record lodged by Defendants on November 6, 2020 [ECF No. 103]; the pleadings and papers on file in this action; and any argument and evidence that is presented on the hearing of this motion.

---

<sup>1</sup> Plaintiffs previously moved for partial summary judgment on September 10, 2020 [ECF No. 62]. The Court denied that motion without prejudice pending Defendants’ production of the administrative record. Order Regulating Proceedings and Record Procedures [ECF No. 93].

Dated: December 2, 2020

Respectfully submitted,

LETITIA JAMES  
*Attorney General of the State of New York*

Matthew Colangelo  
*Chief Counsel for Federal Initiatives*

Elena Goldstein  
*Deputy Chief, Civil Rights Bureau*

By: /s/ Joseph J. Wardenski  
Joseph J. Wardenski, *Senior Trial Counsel*  
Fiona J. Kaye, *Assistant Attorney General*  
Travis England, *Assistant Attorney General*  
Marissa Lieberman-Klein, *Special Assistant Attorney General*  
Office of the New York State Attorney General  
28 Liberty Street  
New York, NY 10005  
(212) 416-8441  
Joseph.Wardenski@ag.ny.gov

*Attorneys for the State of New York*

XAVIER BECERRA  
*Attorney General of California*

MAURA HEALEY  
*Attorney General of Massachusetts*

Renu R. George\*  
*Senior Assistant Attorney General*  
Kathleen Boergers\*  
*Supervising Deputy Attorney General*

By: /s/ Amanda Hainsworth  
Amanda Hainsworth, *Assistant Attorney General\**  
Kimberly A. Parr, *Assistant Attorney General\**  
Office of the Massachusetts Attorney General\*  
One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor  
Boston, Massachusetts 02108  
(617) 963-2618  
amanda.hainsworth@state.ma.us

By: /s/ Neli Palma  
Neli Palma, *Supervisory Deputy Attorney General\**  
Lily Weaver, *Deputy Attorney General\**  
Martine D'Agostino, *Deputy Attorney General\**  
Office of the California Attorney General  
1300 I Street, Suite 125  
P.O. Box 944255  
Sacramento, CA 94244-2550  
(916) 210-7522  
Neli.Palma@doj.ca.gov

*Attorneys for the Commonwealth of Massachusetts*

*Attorneys for the State of California*

PHILIP J. WEISER  
*Attorney General of Colorado*

By: /s/ Eric R. Olson  
Eric R. Olson, *Solicitor General\**  
Office of the Colorado Attorney General  
1300 Broadway, 10th Floor  
Denver, CO 80203  
(720) 508-6000  
eric.olson@coag.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Colorado*

KARL A. RACINE  
*Attorney General  
District of Columbia*

By: /s/ Kathleen Konopka  
Kathleen Konopka  
*Deputy Attorney General, Public Advocacy  
Division*  
Office of the Attorney General for the District of  
Columbia  
441 4th St., N.W. Suite 630S  
Washington, DC 20001  
(202) 724-6610  
Kathleen.Konopka@dc.gov

*Attorneys for the District of Columbia*

CLARE E. CONNORS  
*Attorney General of Hawaii*

By: /s/ Kaliko 'onalani D. Fernandes  
Kaliko 'onalani D. Fernandes, *Deputy Solicitor  
General\**  
Office of the Hawaii Attorney General  
425 Queen Street  
Honolulu, HI 96813  
(808) 586-1360  
kaliko.d.fernandes@hawaii.gov

*Attorney for the State of Hawaii*

WILLIAM TONG  
*Attorney General  
State of Connecticut*

By: /s/ Joshua Perry  
Joshua Perry  
*Special Counsel for Civil Rights*  
Office of the Attorney General  
165 Capitol Avenue  
Hartford, CT 06106  
(860) 808-5372  
Joshua.perry@ct.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Connecticut*

KATHLEEN JENNINGS  
*Attorney General of Delaware*

By: /s/ Vanessa L. Kassab  
Christian Douglas Wright, *Director of Impact  
Litigation*  
Vanessa L. Kassab, *Deputy Attorney General\**  
Delaware Department of Justice  
820 N. French Street, 5th Floor  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
(302) 577-8600  
Vanessa.Kassab@delaware.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Delaware*

KWAME RAOUL  
*Attorney General of the State of Illinois*

By: /s/ Joyce Otuwa  
Joyce C. Otuwa, *Assistant Attorney General\**  
Office of the Illinois Attorney General  
100 West Randolph Street, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Chicago, Illinois 60601  
(312) 857-8386  
JOtuwa@atg.state.il.us

*Attorney for the State of Illinois*

AARON M. FREY  
*Attorney General of Maine*

By: /s/ Susan P. Herman  
Susan P. Herman\*  
*Chief Deputy Attorney General*  
6 State House Station  
Augusta, ME 04333-0006  
(207) 626-8814  
susan.herman@maine.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Maine*

DANA NESSEL  
*Attorney General of Michigan*

By: /s/ Toni L. Harris  
Fadwa A. Hammoud\*  
*Solicitor General*  
Toni L. Harris\*  
Tracy Van den Bergh\*  
*Assistant Attorneys General*  
Michigan Department of Attorney General  
P.O. Box 30758  
Lansing, MI 48909  
(517) 335-7603  
HammoudF1@michigan.gov  
Harrist19@michigan.gov  
VandenBerghT@michigan.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Michigan*

BRIAN E. FROSH  
*Attorney General of Maryland*

By: /s/ Kimberly S. Cammarata  
Kimberly S. Cammarata\*  
*Director, Health Education and Advocacy Unit*  
200 St. Paul Place  
Baltimore, MD 21202  
(410) 576-7038  
kcammarata@oag.state.md.us

*Attorneys for the State of Maryland*

KEITH ELLISON  
*Attorney General of Minnesota*

By: /s/ Megan J. McKenzie  
Megan J. McKenzie\*  
*Assistant Attorney General*  
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 900  
St. Paul, Minnesota 55101-2128  
(651) 757-1405  
megan.mckenzie@ag.state.mn.us

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Minnesota*

AARON D. FORD  
*Attorney General*  
*State of Nevada*

By: /s/ Heidi Parry Stern  
Heidi Parry Stern  
*Solicitor General*  
Craig A. Newby  
*Deputy Solicitor General*  
Office of the Nevada Attorney General  
555 E. Washington Ave., Ste. 3900  
Las Vegas, NV 89101  
HStern@ag.nv.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Nevada*

HECTOR BALDERAS  
*Attorney General of New Mexico*

By: /s/ Tania Maestas  
Tania Maestas\*  
*Chief Deputy Attorney General*  
New Mexico Attorney General  
PO Drawer 1508  
Santa Fe, New Mexico 87504-1508  
(505) 490-4060  
tmaestas@nmag.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of New Mexico,  
by and through Attorney General Hector Balderas*

GURBIR S. GREWAL  
*Attorney General of New Jersey*

Mayur P. Saxena, *Assistant Attorney General*  
Melissa Medoway, *Section Chief, Deputy Attorney  
General\**

By: /s/ Marie Soueid  
Marie Soueid, *Deputy Attorney General*  
John T. Passante, *Deputy Attorney General\**  
New Jersey Attorney General's Office  
Richard J. Hughes Justice Complex  
25 Market Street  
Trenton, NJ 08625  
(609) 376-2564

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of New Jersey*

JOSHUA H. STEIN  
*Attorney General of North Carolina*

By: /s/ Sripriya Narasimhan  
Sripriya Narasimhan\*  
*Deputy General Counsel*  
North Carolina Department of Justice  
114 W. Edenton Street  
Raleigh, NC 27603  
(919) 716-6421  
SNarasimhan@ncdoj.gov

*Attorneys for the State of North Carolina*

ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM  
*Attorney General of the State of Oregon*

By: /s/ Brian A. de Haan

Brian A. de Haan  
*Senior Assistant Attorney General*  
Oregon Department of Justice  
100 SW Market Street  
Portland, OR 97201  
(971) 673-3806  
brian.a.dehaan@doj.state.or.us

*Attorneys for the State of Oregon*

PETER F. NERONHA  
*Attorney General of the State of Rhode Island*

By: /s/ Michael W. Field

Michael W. Field\*  
*Assistant Attorney General*  
Rhode Island Office of Attorney General  
150 South Main Street  
Providence, RI 02903  
(401) 274-4400 x 2380  
mfield@riag.ri.gov

*Attorneys for State of Rhode Island*

JOSH SHAPIRO  
*Attorney General*  
*Commonwealth of Pennsylvania*

By: /s/ Amber Sizemore

Amber Sizemore, Deputy Attorney General\*  
Jacob Boyer, Deputy Attorney General\*  
Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General  
Strawberry Square, 14th Floor  
Harrisburg, PA 17120  
(717) 705-6938  
asizemore@attorneygeneral.gov  
jboyer@attorneygeneral.gov

*Attorneys for the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania*

THOMAS J. DONOVAN, JR.  
*Attorney General of Vermont*

By: /s/ Benjamin Battles

Benjamin Battles, *Solicitor General*  
Emily Adams, *Assistant Attorney General*  
Office of the Attorney General  
109 State Street  
Montpelier, VT 05609-1001  
(802) 828-5500  
benjamin.battles@vermont.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Vermont*

MARK R. HERRING  
*Attorney General of Virginia*

By: /s/ Ryan S. Hardy  
Ryan S. Hardy, *Assistant Attorney General\**  
Office of the Attorney General of Virginia  
202 North 9th Street  
Richmond, Virginia 23219  
(804) 786-0969  
rhardy@oag.state.va.us

*Attorneys for the Commonwealth of Virginia*

JOSHUA L. KAUL  
*Attorney General of Wisconsin*

By: /s/ Steven C. Kilpatrick  
Steven C. Kilpatrick, *Assistant Attorney General\**  
Wisconsin Department of Justice  
Post Office Box 7857  
Madison, Wisconsin 53707-7857  
(608) 266-1792  
kilpatricksc@doj.state.wi.us

*Attorneys for State of Wisconsin*

*\*Appearing pro hac vice or application for admission pro hac vice forthcoming*