

1 BRIAN M. BOYNTON
Principal Deputy Assistant Attorney General

2 ERIC BECKENHAUER
3 Assistant Branch Director
4 Civil Division

5 STEVEN A. MYERS (NY Bar # 4823043)
6 Senior Trial Counsel
7 United States Department of Justice
8 Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch
9 1100 L St. NW
10 Washington, DC 20005
11 Tel: (202) 305-8648
12 Fax: (202) 616-8470
13 E-mail: steven.a.myers@usdoj.gov

Samara Spence* (DC Bar No. 1031191)
Jeffrey B. Dubner* (DC Bar No. 1013399)
Sean A. Lev* (DC Bar. No. 449936)
Democracy Forward Foundation
P.O. Box 34553
Washington, DC 20043
sspence@democracyforward.org
jdubner@democracyforward.org
slev@democracyforward.org
(202) 701-1785
(202) 448-9090

Counsel for Plaintiffs

Additional counsel listed on signature block

** Admitted pro hac vice*

Attorneys for Defendants

13 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
14 **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**
15 **SAN JOSE DIVISION**

16 COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA, *et al.*,

17 Plaintiffs,

18 v.

19 U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND
HUMAN SERVICES, *et al.*,

20 Defendants.

) Case No. 5:21-cv-01655-BLF

) **JOINT STATUS REPORT AND STIPULATED**
) **REQUEST FOR ORDER CONTINUING STAY**

21
22 Pursuant to the Court’s Order of March 8, 2022, *see* ECF No. 43, the parties respectfully submit
23 the following joint status report addressing further proceedings, together with a stipulated request for an
24 order continuing the stay of this action through August 2, 2022.

25 1. This is an Administrative Procedure Act (“APA”) case in which Plaintiffs challenge a final
26 rule promulgated by the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (“HHS”) entitled *Securing*
27 *Updated and Necessary Statutory Evaluations Timely*, 86 Fed. Reg. 5694 (2021) (the “SUNSET Rule”).
28

1 The SUNSET Rule provides, in essential part, that nearly all regulations issued by HHS in Titles 21, 42,
2 and 45 of the Code of Federal Regulations shall expire at the end of (1) five calendar years after the year
3 that the SUNSET Rule first becomes effective, (2) ten calendar years after the year of the regulation's
4 promulgation, or (3) ten calendar years after the last year in which HHS assessed and, if required, reviewed
5 the regulation, whichever is latest.

6 2. Plaintiffs filed their complaint challenging the SUNSET Rule on March 9, 2021. *See* ECF
7 No. 1. Plaintiffs alleged that the SUNSET Rule is *ultra vires*, *see id.* ¶¶ 123-30; arbitrary and capricious,
8 *see id.* ¶¶ 131-33; in violation of the APA's notice-and-comment requirements, *see id.* ¶¶ 134-39; and in
9 violation of HHS's Tribal Consultation Policy, *see id.* ¶¶ 140-44. Plaintiffs further alleged that the
10 SUNSET Rule threatens imminent and irreparable harm to them and the general public, including by
11 creating regulatory confusion and uncertainty that will impede their ongoing operations, budgeting, and
12 planning activities. *See, e.g., id.* ¶¶ 100-02; *see generally id.* ¶¶ 95-122.

13 3. As promulgated, the SUNSET Rule was scheduled to become effective on March 22, 2021.
14 *See* 86 Fed. Reg. at 5694. Shortly before the SUNSET Rule became effective, HHS postponed its effective
15 date for one year, to March 22, 2022, pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 705. *See* 86 Fed. Reg. 15,404 (2021). On
16 October 28, 2021, HHS issued a Notice of Proposed Rulemaking proposing to withdraw or repeal the
17 SUNSET Rule. *See* 86 Fed. Reg. 59,906 (2021). In March 2022, HHS postponed the effective date of
18 the SUNSET Rule for an additional six months, to September 22, 2022. *See* 87 Fed. Reg. 12,399 (2022).

19 4. On May 27, 2022, HHS issued a Final Rule withdrawing the SUNSET Rule as of the
20 effective date of July 26, 2022. *See* 87 Fed. Reg. 32246 (2022). If the Final Rule takes effect as scheduled,
21 this litigation may be unnecessary.

22 5. The parties therefore jointly request that the Court continue the stay of this action through
23 August 2, 2022, and direct the parties to either stipulate to the dismissal of this action, or file a joint status
24 report proposing a schedule for further proceedings, by that date.

25 Date: June 7, 2022

Respectfully submitted,

26 BRIAN M. BOYNTON
Principal Deputy Assistant Attorney General

27 ERIC BECKENHAUER
Assistant Branch Director

1 Civil Division

2 /s/ Steven A. Myers
3 STEVEN A. MYERS (NY Bar # 4823043)
4 Senior Trial Counsel
5 United States Department of Justice
6 Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch
7 1100 L St. NW
8 Washington, DC 20005
9 Tel: (202) 305-8648
10 Fax: (202) 616-8470
11 E-mail: steven.a.myers@usdoj.gov

12 *Attorneys for Defendants*

13 /s/ Samara M. Spence
14 Jeffrey B. Dubner* (DC Bar No. 1013399)
15 Samara Spence* (DC Bar No. 1031191)
16 Sean A. Lev* (DC Bar. No. 449936)
17 Democracy Forward Foundation
18 P.O. Box 34553
19 Washington, DC 20043
20 sspence@democracyforward.org
21 jdubner@democracyforward.org
22 slev@democracyforward.org
23 Telephone: (202) 448-9090

24 *Counsel for All Plaintiffs*

25 James R. Williams (CA Bar No. 271253)
26 County Counsel
27 Greta S. Hansen (CA Bar No. 251471)
28 Douglas M. Press (CA Bar No. 168740)
Laura S. Trice (CA Bar No. 284837)
Office of the County Counsel
County of Santa Clara
70 West Hedding Street, East Wing, 9th Fl.
San José, CA 95110-1770
laura.trice@cco.sccgov.org
Telephone: (408) 299-5900

Counsel for the County of Santa Clara

Lisa S. Mankofsky* (DC Bar No. 411931)
Matthew Simon* (DC Bar No. 144727)
Center for Science in the Public Interest
1250 I Street, NW, Ste. 500
Washington, DC 20005
lmankofsky@cspinet.org

msimon@cspinet.org
Telephone: (202) 777-8381

*Counsel for Center for Science in the Public
Interest*

Adeline S. Rolnick*
Natural Resources Defense Council
1152 15th Street NW, Ste. 300
Washington, DC 20005
arolnick@nrdc.org
Telephone: (202) 513-6240

Counsel for Natural Resources Defense Council

** Admitted pro hac vice*

LOCAL RULE 5-1(i) ATTESTATION

I attest that I have obtained Samara Spence's concurrence in the filing of this document.

/s/ Steven A. Myers
Steven A. Myers

[PROPOSED] ORDER

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED. The case shall remain STAYED through August 2, 2022, by which date the parties shall either stipulate to the dismissal of this action or submit a joint status report proposing a schedule for further proceedings.

Dated: _____

HON. BETH LABSON FREEMAN
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28